



SANATA DHARMA UNIVERSITY

Faculty : Teachers Training and Education
Study Program : English Education Master's Program

SEMESTER LESSON PLAN

A. Course Identity

| | | |
|---|---------------------------|--|
| 1 | Course Code / Course Name | : IEDU203/ Teacher Identity Construction |
| 2 | Credits / Contact Hours | : 3 SKS |
| 3 | Prerequisites | : - |
| 4 | Semester | : 2 |
| 5 | Academic Year | : 2023 |
| 6 | Lecturer | : Paulus Kuswandono, Ph.D. Drs. Concilianus Laos Mbato, M.A., Ed.D. |

B. Program Learning Outcomes (PLO)

PLO 1: Graduates are able to demonstrate skills to design, implement, and evaluate English learning based on metacognitive theory and applied linguistics.

PLO 2: Graduates are able to demonstrate ethical skills for conducting contemporary research in the field of English education based on metacognitive theory and applied linguistics.

C. Course Description

Teacher Identity Construction (IEDU203) provides students with analysis of current research trends about identity construction of becoming teachers. The course also examines aspects of reflective practice theories and transformative leadership as an integral part of becoming an English teacher.

D. Learning Outcomes / Competence

On completing the course, the students are expected to be able to improve the followings:

Competence:

- a. understand theories in identity construction
- b. understand various issues in reflective practice.
- c. present research papers on teacher identity construction in a conference
- d. publish research papers on teacher identity construction in a journal

Conscience:

- a. gain more awareness on the teacher identity construction issues
- b. improve their responsibility and autonomy in writing teacher identity construction research papers.

Compassion

1. grow interests for teacher identity construction research
2. have greater passion for teacher identity construction research
3. work collaboratively to complete the assigned projects

Commitment:

1. Undertake thoughtful integrity to finish the assigned book/material/design projects
2. Express personal and moral commitment to complete book/material/design project

E. Learning Methods:

The learning methods in this course are informed by current learning theories, i.e., constructivism, metacognition and self-regulated learning theories and carried out **interactively, holistically, integratively, scientifically, contextually, thematically, effectively, collaboratively, and centered on the students as explained below:**

a. Interactive

Learning in this course is carried out interactively through various learning activities, for example, student-student, student-lecturer, and lecturer-student activities.

b. Holistic

Holistic learning in this course covers three educational domains, namely cognitive, psychomotor and affective domains. In every learning activity, the lecturer not only delivers lecture materials that hone students' cognitive abilities but also integrate the basic values of the study program and faculty/University, namely *conscience* (choosing one's conscience), *compassion* (feelings of compassion) and *commitment* (holding firm to commitments), into the lecture material.

c. Integrative

Technology is integrated into every lesson both as a learning tool and as learning media, as well as learning resources, especially in enriching study materials

that depend on technological developments, such as access to international journals, whether subscribed or not, e-book access.

d. Scientific

This course aims to produce graduates who are strong and persistent in seeking and discovering academic truths through scientific learning processes. The scientific learning process integrates learning models which enable students to identify problems, and their causes, formulate problems, find solutions to problems, such as through project-based learning, problem-based learning, inquiry learning, self-regulated learning and metacognition.

e. Contextual

Contextual learning is achieved in this course through its adherence to contextual and learning materials that can be accessed through the campus comprehensive library collections and virtual learning resources both national and international. In addition, this course encourages students to conduct research and publish on the contextual and relevant topics in the literature and in society.

f. Thematic

In line with the contextual characteristics of learning, this course is also characterized by its focus on the related themes in understanding major topics in English education. The themes cover various teacher identity issues, namely identity and integrity, professional identity, teachers' agency, emotions, and resilience.

g. Effective

This course has been planned effectively to last for 16 meetings including mid-term exams and end-of-semester examinations with every meeting discussing pre-determined topics that have been set in the lesson planning.

h. Collaborative

Class lectures are held collaboratively in accordance with one aspect of Ignatian Pedagogy, i.e., *Compassion*, which aims to develop the students' ability to work together to achieve goals, respect differences of opinions and develop conflict handling skills.

i. Student-centered

All lectures in this course are student-centered so that they are accustomed to actively finding problems, solving problems, developing ideas, conducting collaborative research with lecturers, and presenting research results in seminars.

F. Student Workload

| Learning Activities and Tasks | Student Work Load |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| Class scheduled meeting | 48 |
| Worksheets | 32 |
| Presentation | 32 |
| Mid Term Paper | 10 |
| Final Paper | 13 |
| Total | 135 |

G. Topics

| No | Topic | Learning Outcomes | Teaching-learning Strategies | Learning Materials |
|----|--|--|---|--|
| 1. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Introduction of the course The Heart of a Teacher: Identity and Integrity in Teaching (Chapter 1) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Students are able to identify the basic concepts of <u>identity and integrity</u> on becoming a teacher. Students are able to reflect the basic concepts identity and integrity in educational contexts. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lecture Discussion | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Syllabus Siswanto, I. L., & Kuswandono, P. (2020). Palmer, P. J. (2003), pp. 9-33. |
| 2. | The Hidden Wholeness Paradox in Teaching and Learning (Chapter 3) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Students are able to recognize the basic concepts of <u>paradoxes</u> in teaching Students are able to reflect the teaching paradoxes and relate them to the teachers' lives. | Group 1 Presentation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lecture Discussion | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Weran, Y. I. T., & Kuswandono, P. (2021). Palmer, P. J. (2003), pp. 61-87. |
| 3. | 1. Teacher Professional Identity (Chapter 3) 2. Concept of Teacher Identity Construction (Chapter 2) | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Students are able to identify the basic concepts of <u>professional identity</u> on becoming a teacher to develop teacher professionalism. Students are able to apply the basic concepts professional identity in educational contexts. | Group 2 Presentation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lecture Discussion | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Pravita, A. R., & Kuswandono, P. (2021). Castañeda (2011), pp. 16-64 |
| 4. | 1. Chapter 21. Research on Teacher Identity: Common Themes, Implications, and Future Directions 2. Reflections on Language Teacher Identity Research: An introduction | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Students are able to understand the <u>general themes, implications, and future directions</u> of research studies on teacher identity. Students are able to compose <u>research plan (prospectus)</u> on teacher identity development. | Group 3 Presentation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lecture Discussion | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Hong, Francis, and Schutz (2018), pp. 243-251. Barkhuizen, Gary. (2017) |
| 5. | 1. Chapter 6. Professional Identity Matters: Agency, | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Students are able to identify <u>teachers' agency, emotions, and resilience</u> which construct teacher professional | Group 4 Presentation | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Day, Christopher (2018), (p. 61-70) |

| No | Topic | Learning Outcomes | Teaching-learning Strategies | Learning Materials |
|-----|---|--|---|---|
| | Emotions, and Resilience 2. Journal: A Questionnaire and Model of Role Identity for Iranian English Language Teachers: A Structural Equation Modeling 3. Submit topics and outline for Final Paper | identity (TPD). • Students are able to compose research plan (prospectus) on teacher identity development. | • Lecture • Discussion | • Sadeghi & Sahragard (2016) |
| 6. | Methods of Information Literacy Research: Critical Incidents | • Students are able to understand research methods for teacher identity studies (e.g., critical incidents). • Students are able to compose research method (e.g. qualitative study) on teacher identity development. | Group 5 Presentation • Lecture • Discussion | • Averina, F. E., & Kuswandono, P. (2022). • Hughes (2007) |
| 7. | Writing workshop | • Students are able to write and develop the research draft for teacher identity construction issues. | • Discussion • Individual consultation | • Students' paper draft |
| 8. | Midterm Test (Submission of second draft article) | | | |
| | | | | • Submission in Week 9. |
| 9. | 1. Chapter 2. Teacher Identity Discourse as Identity Growth: Stories of Authority and Vulnerability 2. Journal: Understanding teacher identity: an overview of issues | 1. Students are able to understand the transformative negotiation affecting identity, Identity, Vulnerability and Authority on becoming a teacher. 2. Students are able to apply the theories and studies to develop research on teacher identity development. | • Lecture • Discussion | • Alsup, Janet (2018), pp. 13-23 |
| 10. | 1. Chapter 5. Critical Events, Emotional Episodes, and Teacher | 1. Students are able to understand the critical events, emotional episodes, and teacher attributions constructing | Group 1 Presentation • Lecture | • Schutz, Nichols, and Schwenke (2018), p. 49-60. |

| No | Topic | Learning Outcomes | Teaching-learning Strategies | Learning Materials |
|-----|---|---|---|---|
| | <p>Attributions in the Development of Teacher Identities</p> <p>2. Journal: A sociocultural approach to understanding teacher identity, agency and professional vulnerability in a context of secondary school reform</p> | <p>identity.</p> <p>2. Students are able to apply the theories and studies to develop research on teacher identity development.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussion | |
| 11. | <p>1. Chapter 8. Engaging Teacher Identities in Teacher Education: Shifting Notions of the “Good Teacher” to Broaden Teachers’ Learning.</p> <p>2. Journal: Theorizing Language Teacher Identity: Three Perspectives and Beyond</p> | <p>1. Students are able to understand the problematic nature of “good teacher” within teacher narratives.</p> <p>2. Students are able to apply the theories and studies to develop research on teacher identity development.</p> | <p>Group 2</p> <p>Presentation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lecture • Discussion | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Grace A. Chen, Ilana S. Horn, and Susan Bobbitt Nolen (2018), pp. 85-96 |
| 12. | <p>1. Chapter 11. Student Teachers’ Identity Development in Relation to “Teaching for Creativity”</p> <p>2. Journal: Teacher education as identity construction: insights from action research</p> | <p>1. Students are able to understand the concepts of “Teaching for Creativity” as an integral part of teachers’ professional identity development.</p> <p>2. Students are able to apply the theories and studies to develop research on teacher identity development.</p> | <p>Group 3</p> <p>Presentation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lecture • Discussion | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Meijer and Oosterheertpp. (2018) 121-132 |
| 13. | <p>1. Chapter 14: Becoming a Language Teacher: Tracing the Mediation and Internalization Processes of Pre- service Teachers</p> | <p>1. Students are able to understand the complex mediation and internalization processes that affect the teacher identity development.</p> <p>2. Students are able to apply the theories and studies to develop research on</p> | <p>Group 4</p> <p>Presentation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Lecture • Discussion | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dimitrieska, Vesna (2018), pp. 157-168 |

| No | Topic | Learning Outcomes | Teaching-learning Strategies | Learning Materials |
|-----|---|---|---|-----------------------------|
| | 2. Journal: Teacher identity development in the first year of teacher education | teacher identity development. | | |
| 14. | 1. Chapter 7. Using Discourse to Create a Teacher Identity: Borderland Narratives (Chapter 8, p. 147); 2. Chapter 8. Teaching Is ... an Analysis of the Metaphor | 1. Students are able to understand the complex nature of teachers' identity within the borderland discourse . 2. Students are able to apply the theories and studies to develop research on teacher identity development. | Group 5 Presentation • Lecture • Discussion | • Alsup (2018), pp. 125-165 |
| 15. | Paper Review | • Students are able to apply the theories and studies to develop research on teacher identity development. | • Individual Consultation and Peer review | Student's individual paper |
| 16. | Final Test: (Paper Submission) | • Students are able to complete the research report on teacher identity development. | • Writing Project | Student's individual paper |

H. References:

- Averina, F. E., & Kuswandono, P. (2022). From Pre-Service to Novice: Unraveling EFL Teachers' Professional Identity Transformation through the Lens of Critical Incident Technique. *Jurnal Sinestesia*, 12(2), 552-565.
- Pravita, A. R., & Kuswandono, P. (2021). Exploring English Novice Teachers' Identity Transformation Influenced by Community of Practice. *IDEAS: Journal on English Language Teaching and Learning, Linguistics and Literature*, 9(1).
- Weran, Y. I. T., & Kuswandono, P. (2021). Teacher identity as a root of teacher selves: Professional identity vs personal identity. *Journal of English Educational Study (JEES)*, 4(1), 49-58.
- Siswanto, I. L., & Kuswandono, P. (2020). Understanding Teacher Identity Construction: Professional Experiences of Becoming Indonesian Montessori Teachers. *Understanding Teacher Identity Construction Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics*, 5(1), 2020. www.ijeltal.org
- Alsup, Janet (2018). Teacher Identity Discourse as Identity Growth: Stories of Authority and Vulnerability. In *Research on Teacher Identity: Mapping Challenges and Innovations*. Bloomington: Springer International. pp. 13-23
- Day, Christopher (2018). Professional Identity Matters: Agency, Emotions, and Resilience. In *Research on Teacher Identity: Mapping Challenges and Innovations*. Bloomington: Springer International
- Schutz, Paul A., Hong, Ji, and Francis, Dionne Cross. (2018). Research on Teacher Identity: Introduction to Mapping Challenges and Innovations. In *Research*

on *Teacher Identity: Mapping Challenges and Innovations*. Bloomington: Springer International Publishing

Grace A. Chen, Ilana S. Horn, and Susan Bobbitt Nolen (2018). Engaging Teacher Identities in Teacher Education: Shifting Notions of the “Good Teacher” to Broaden Teachers’ Learning. In *Research on Teacher Identity: Mapping Challenges and Innovations*. Bloomington: Springer International Publishing. pp. 85- 96

Meijer and Oosterheertpp. (2018). Student Teachers’ Identity Development in Relation to “Teaching for Creativity”. In *Research on Teacher Identity: Mapping Challenges and Innovations*. Bloomington: Springer International Publishing. 121-132

Dimitrieska, Vesna (2018). Becoming a Language Teacher: Tracing the Mediation and Internalization Processes of Pre-service Teachers. In *Research on Teacher Identity: Mapping Challenges and Innovations*. Bloomington: Springer International Publishing. pp. 157-168

Barkhuizen, G. (2017). *Reflections on Language Teacher Identity Research*. New York: Taylor & Francis.
https://books.google.co.id/books?id=Ewh6DQAAQBAJ&printsec=frontcover&source=gbs_ge_summary_r&cad=0#v=onepage&q&f=false

Friesen, M. D., & Besley, S. C. (2013). Teacher identity development in the first year of teacher education: A developmental and social psychological perspective. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 36, 23-32.

Kuswandono, P. (2013). The Journey of Becoming a Teacher: Indonesian Pre -Service Teachers Reflecting on Their Professional Learning. Unpublished thesis. Melbourne: Monash University

Castaneda, J. A. F. (2011). *Teacher Identity Construction: exploring the nature of becoming a primary school language teacher*. University of Newcastle upon Tyne.

Hughes, Hilary and Williamson, Kirsty and Lloyd, Annemaree (2007) *Critical incident technique*. In: Lipu, Suzanne, (ed) Exploring methods in information literacy research. Topics in Australasian Library and Information Studies, Number 28 . Centre for Information Studies, Charles Sturt University, Wagga Wagga, N.S.W., pp. 49- 66.

Alsop, J. (2018). *Teacher identity discourses: Negotiating personal and professional spaces* . New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.

Palmer, P. J. (2003). Courage to teach : E xploring the inner land scape of a teach er’s life . San Fransisco, Jossey-Bass. (Chapter 1)

C. Evaluation

| | |
|---|------|
| Group Presentation on assigned topic (participation) | 15% |
| Paper Draft 1: Introduction and theoretical review (Test 1) | 25% |
| Paper Draft 2: Discussion and conclusion (Test 2) | 25% |
| Final Paper | 35% |
| Attendance | |
| | 100% |



SANATA DHARMA UNIVERSITY

Faculty : Teachers Training and Education
Study Program : English Education Master's Program

COURSE TASKS DESIGN

D. Course Identity

| | | |
|---|---------------------------|--|
| 1 | Course Code / Course Name | : IEDU203/English Teacher Identity Construction : |
| 2 | Credits / Contact Hours | 3 SKS |
| 3 | Prerequisites | : - |
| 4 | Semester | : 2 |
| 5 | Academic | : 2023 |
| 6 | Year | : Paulus Kuswandono, Ph.D. |
| | Lecturer | Concilianus Laos Mbato, Ed.D. |

B1 Task Design for Competence Aspect

1. Objectives of Task

Students are able to :

- Analyse current research trends about reflective practice theories and identity construction of becoming teachers.
- Examines aspects of transformative leadership as an integral part of becoming an English teacher.

2. Description of Task

a. Task Items:

- Presentation: Students identify meaningful concepts of teacher identity construction.
- Progress Test 1: Students generate topic/s and research questions according to the emerging research studies in language teacher identity construction.
- Progress Test 2: Students understand how to write academic paper writing according to a set of journal rubrics.
- Final Test: Students understand and can finalise an academic paper writing according to a set of journal rubrics.

b. Task Instruction and Scopes:

- Presentation: Students present the assigned topics in front of the class and lead the smaller group discussion based on problem/case- based learning.
- Progress Test 1: Students search for the most crucial topics and research questions according to the emerging research studies in language teacher identity construction and submit the first draft.
- Progress Test 2: Students submit the second draft of academic paper writing according to a set of journal rubrics.
- Final Test: Students finish an academic paper writing according to a set of journal rubrics.

c. Method and Mode of Task Completion:

- Group presentation
- Small group discussion
- First draft writing
- Second draft writing
- Writing the final draft for submission

d. Outcome of Task Completion:

- Presentation: power point and worksheets of case/problem-based learning.
- Progress Test 1: first draft paper writing.
- Progress Test 2: first draft paper writing
- Final Test: finalised paper writing for journal publication.

3. Assessment Criteria

| No | | Score | Grade | Scale 1-4 |
|----|----|--------|-------|-----------|
| 1 | 85 | 85-100 | A | 3,4 |
| 2 | 80 | 80-84 | A- | 3,2 |
| 3 | 75 | 75-79 | B+ | 3 |
| 4 | 70 | 70-74 | B | 2,8 |
| 5 | 65 | 65-69 | B- | 2,6 |
| 6 | 60 | 60-64 | C+ | 2,4 |
| 7 | 56 | 56-59 | C | 2,24 |
| 8 | 50 | 50-55 | D | 2 |
| 9 | 0 | 0-49 | E | 0 |

*Coloured rows: Fail.

B2 Task Design for Conscience Aspect

1. Objectives of Task

Students are able to :

- a. Internalise the concepts of teacher identity and relate them to their life values
- b. Respect view point differences among peers and understand that the different perception of teacher identity is an enrichment part of wider perspectives.

2. Description of Task

- a. Presentation: Students reflect the meanings of their experiences in small groups and write the results of their reflection in a reflective log (Exelsa).
- b. The first draft: Students reflect struggle (difficulties or excitement) during drafting.
- c. The second draft: Students reflect struggle (difficulties or excitement) during drafting.

3. Outcome of Task Completion:

Reflective log: It reflects students' perception and feelings on different assigned topics based on their learning experiences.

4. Assessment Criteria

Rubric for the conscience assessment is attached.

B3 Task Design for Compassion

Aspect

1. Objectives of Task

Students are able to :

- a. explain their concerns on socio-political issues embedded in each of the assigned topic.
- b. affirm their planned actions to manifest their socio-political concerns in the form of reflective writing.

2. Objectives of Task

Students are able to :

Construct the intention to contribute meaningful help for the society in relation to the concepts of teacher identity

Assessment Rubric: Presentation

| Delivery Modes | | Score: 1-10 |
|----------------|---|-------------|
| 1 | Delivery: (show enthusiasm, not rushing, avoid too much pause, showing positive feelings about the topic of presentation.) | |
| 2 | Eye Contact: (not reading the notes/ppt excessively, talking to students, rather than on the projector screen) | |
| 3 | Volume: (clearly heard for students, even for those sitting in the last row) | |
| 4 | Interaction: Q and A along the way, engaging the participants with meaningful activities (telling students' stories, quiz, etc.) | |
| Content | | |
| 5 | Introduction: begins with clear focus: stating objectives and background of the topic | |
| 6 | Topic: The presentation demonstrates important element of the assigned material, contents are developed and given examples via other sources (personal, internet, journal, etc.) | |
| 7 | Organisation: The material is well organized, using interesting visualization (e.g., power point, video clips, pictures, mind maps, diagrams, charts, whiteboard, etc.). Note: ppt means "short pointers", not full, long sentences. | |
| 8 | Conclusion and "Q and A Session" : a. The presentation emphasizes important points and is concluded with strong statements. | |
| 9 | b. Comments and questions from audience are responded tactfully with clear explanation and examples | |
| TOTAL | | |

Adapted from:

https://www.google.co.id/?gws_rd=cr,ssl&ei=gCAFVMnwL8e5uASl6ILgCA#q=rubric+for+presentation

Assessment Rubric Review
Form: Research Papers
Credit to IJAL (Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics)

Manuscript Title : _____
 Authors : _____

| Aspects | *Score | Evidence (whenever applies): Please exemplify from the journal article (copy paste) |
|---|--------|---|
| Title | | |
| 1. States the article's main theme | | |
| 2. Describes the type of research done | | |
| 3. If space permits: Tells where the research was done (e.g., country and / or type of institution) | | |
| Abstract | | |
| 4. Begins with a brief description of the article's main theme and context | | |
| 5. Accurately summarizes: (1) background of the study, (2) the purpose of the research, (3) method used, (4) findings/results, main conclusions, and (5) academic and practical implications of the results / findings. | | |
| 6. Does not contain any figures, tables, or in-text references | | |
| 7. Does not exceed 300 words and accompanied by keywords | | |
| Introductory Paragraph(s) | | |
| 8. Presents the topic of the study and its academic and practical importance to readers | | |
| 9. Briefly summarizes other literature on the topic | | |
| 10. Points out the most important gaps or controversies in the literature and how the study addresses them (<i>necessary</i>) | | |
| 11. Introduces the research problem addressed by the study | | |
| 12. Outlines the specific research objectives of the research | | |
| 13. Describes the context of the study, including the subjects of the research | | |
| 14. Provides readers with an outline of the rest of the article | | |
| Literature Review | | |
| 15. Tells where the research topic fits in the larger context of education | | |
| 16. Focuses primarily on recent literature (within the last 5 years from the DOI/Date of Issue) | | |
| 17. Uses no, or very few, secondary sources | | |
| 18. Provides adequate support for the selection of the research question(s) by discussing previous research findings related to the research topic | | |

| | | |
|--|--|--|
| 19. Integrates and organizes these findings around relevant main topics, showing that the author has a good understanding of the literature(<i>in the specific context of the topic studied</i>) | | |
| 20. Summarizes the research found and synthesizes to logically introduce the research question(s) and method(s). | | |
| Method | | |
| 21. Logically follows the literature review | | |
| 22. Describes the context of the study and the population sampled | | |
| 23. Describes the sampling method used(<i>necessary</i>) | | |
| 24. Outlines and defends the data collection method(s) used(<i>necessary</i>) | | |
| 25. Discusses how the data were collected and why | | |

| Results / Findings | | |
|--|--|--|
| 26. Are directly connected to methodology and address the research question(s) | | |
| 27. Summarize the data collected using descriptive statistics | | |
| 28. Report the results of any statistical analyses used (<i>necessary</i>) | | |
| 29. Include enough detail to justify the methodology and conclusions | | |
| 30. Avoid unnecessary repetition | | |
| 31. Use tables and figures only if they are relevant and not redundant | | |
| Discussion | | |
| 32. Summarizes the results in relation to the research objective(s) | | |
| 33. Interprets the results as they relate to the paper's literature review (findings of previous researchers) | | |
| 34. Provides possible explanations for unexpected results (if necessary) | | |
| 35. Points out any limitations of the study's design or execution that might affect its validity and its applicability to other contexts | | |
| 36. Discusses practical applications for classrooms or other educational settings in diverse contexts | | |
| 37. The content is relevant, current, and interesting to international readers. | | |
| 38. The content is useful or relevant to the development context. | | |
| 39. The discussion of the topic is not limited to one particular context or country. | | |
| Conclusion | | |
| 40. Restates the study's main purpose and key results | | |
| 41. Discusses possible directions for related future research (<i>necessary</i>) | | |

* Please use the following scale to rank each category (1, 2, 3, 4, 5)

1 = unacceptable

2 = needs much improvement

3 = acceptable but still needs major

improvements 4 = good but still

needs some improvement

5 = excellent (needs little or no change)

(Continued from above)

| WRITTEN EXPRESSION | | | |
|---------------------------|---|--|--|
| Y / N | The writing is clear, concise, and grammatically correct. Specific comments | | |
| Y / N | The writing is professional and academic. | | |
| Y / N | The paper stays focused on the topic. | | |
| Y / N | The paper is coherent between and within sections. | | |
| Y / N | The first person has not been misused or overused (The first person, if in the text at all, should be used sparingly and appropriately, primarily to avoid the passive voice in describing procedures or discussing results, not to create an exaggerated sense of the author's importance or authority. Any use of "we" should refer to the authors only. | | |
| Y / N | There is no discriminatory language of any kind in the paper. | | |
| FORMAT | | | |
| Y / N | The content is well-organized, and based on an academic format. | | |
| Y / N | There should be introduction, literature review, method, finding and discussion and conclusion. | | |
| Y / N | The figures, tables, or other illustrations are necessary and appropriate and are referred to in the text. | | |
| Y / N | All references are both in-text and in the reference list. | | |
| Y / N | All references in the text and in the reference list follow APA style (see author's guideline on OJS system if necessary). | | |
| Y / N | The content is well-organized, and based on an academic format. | | |